

Episode Thirty-Nine - The Mind And Spirit Are Not Supernatural But Parts of A Man Just Like The Head and Foot

Post by "Cassius" of October 4, 2020 at 10:29 AM

Thanks to Charles for this link -- we are going to need to double back and address this to understand the issue of "harmony" -- another example where Epicurus is attacking Plato. Sounds like Epicurus/Lucretius are supporting Simmias, at least to some extent, but possibly not fully:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Simmias_o...lato.27s_Phaedo

Simmias' attunement analogy^[5]

1. Body is visible, composite and mortal.
2. A harp is visible, composite and mortal.
3. When the harp is destroyed the tune which is ethereal, invisible and divine is also destroyed.
4. The soul is like a tune (*harmonia*) of the parts of the body. If the body is destroyed, the tune cannot survive.

Socrates attacks Simmias's Analogy with four different arguments:^[6]

1. Harmonia-argument would be a contradiction to the anamnesis-argument that Simmias had already agreed on before.
2. If the soul would be a tune, and bodies can be tuned differently, there would be more or lesser souls - which is not possible.
3. Virtue is the proper attunement of the soul, and vice the lack of such an attunement. But if the soul itself is an attunement, then virtue and vice would be attunements of an attunement. But an attunement can't participate in non-attunement. So if a soul is a perfect attunement, it could not have virtue or vice.
4. The soul is the ruling principle of the body. But attunement is governed by the material of the musical instrument. By analogy, that would make the body the ruler of the soul.

Thus, Simmias' argument cannot be upheld.