

Ongoing Discussion of Jack Gedney's "Untroubled" Substack Blog

Post by "Cassius" of May 16, 2026 at 9:00 AM

Ok there Don you're addressing the full categorization scheme by referencing necessary/unnecessary.

What if we focus precisely on one of the aspects of what wbernys said:

Can something that is a "natural desire" turn into an unnatural desire?

I think a lot of the confusion comes from the appropriate thought that we ought to be able to construct a table with "natural desires" in one column and "unnatural desires" on the other so that we can see clearly what distinguishes the two categories.

If "desire for food" is natural but "desire for caviar" is not, then should we not be able to consider them as forever separate so that we can see what element or aspect must be "added to" the desire for food in order to identify something that is unnatural?

And we ought to be able to do that separate from considering the "necessary" part.

Separate and apart from any other topic, what makes something "natural" and something else "unnatural"? It's NOT simply a question of "is it present at birth?" Or is it?

I presume your "Yes" means you think that you don't think it is sufficient to say "the desire was present at birth."

Separate and apart from the necessary criteria, what does "natural" mean? Because I can see someone arguing that if it's natural, it's natural from the start and forever, just like atoms have shape, size, and weight.