

PD02 - Best Translation To Feature At EpicureanFriends?

Post by "Cassius" of November 14, 2024 at 12:28 PM

[Quote from Eikadistes](#)

It would be more prudent to express the idea that "Those who have died are definitely not experiencing an afterlife."

Yes I definitely think that's the primary take-home point of the whole thing, as per what is said in the letter to Menoeceus:

Become accustomed to the belief that [death is nothing to us](#). For all good and evil consists in sensation, but [death is deprivation of sensation](#). And therefore a right understanding that [death is nothing to us](#) makes the mortality of life enjoyable, not because it adds to it an infinite span of time, but because it takes away the craving for immortality.

The tricky part to me is that [PD02](#) seems to be focusing on deprivation of sensation in a somewhat different way than the letter - making a deeper point about the relationship between sensation and being alive.

I don't think we've addressed the question, sort of like the sorites question, of "How many faculties can you subtract from a human and still have something that is alive? I tend to think that "sensation" is sometimes being used not only to refer to the five senses but also to pain and pleasure and prolepsis.

Can you still have pain or pleasure or prolepsis without having any of the five bodily senses? I think it makes a considerable difference whether the answer is (A) once the five senses are gone you are dead or (B) once the five senses AND pain and pleasure AND prolepsis is gone you are dead.

The implication of the standard translation of that last clause as "and that which lacks perception in no way exists for us" may tend to make some people think that any absence of all of the five senses equals death, but I am not sure at all that that is correct unless we also specify that feeling (pain and pleasure) and prolepsis are also gone. Being "unconscious" might suspend the five senses, but would not equal a state that is "nothingness" in the same way that death would. Or would it?

Opinions on any of that?