

VS41 - Thoughts on and translations of VS41

Post by "Onenski" of November 1, 2023 at 10:20 PM

Hi, [Don](#) ! Today we were talking about this VS and I shared a philological question with [Cassius](#) , [Joshua](#) , [Kalosyni](#) and Steve.

I have a translation that follows a slightly different version (I think it's only one word) from that used by Bailey, Arrighetti, Long and Sedley, etc. It's this:

Quote

Γελᾶν ἅμα δεῖν καὶ φιλοσοφεῖν καὶ οἰκονομεῖν καὶ τοῖς λοιποῖς οἰκειώμασι χρῆσθαι καὶ μηδαμῇ λέγειν τὰς ἐκ τῆς **ὀργῆς** φιλοσοφίας φωνὰς ἀφιέντας.

This is Alberto Enrique Álvarez' translation (the Spanish guy who wrote a dissertation on the Vatican Sayings):

Quote

"We must laugh as well as philosophize, manage the house and take care of the rest of our private affairs, and by no means **express angry maxims** when we declare the maxims of philosophy."

And these are some of his comments:

"The sentence has undergone numerous modifications. In our version we have opted, like Bollack, to keep the textual version of the manuscript, since it has a satisfactory sense and syntax, and in the conviction that, in this case, it is possible to keep the transmitted text without variants.

[...]

This version [Bailey's version] recovers the importance of laughter as a vital mark of epicureanism; but, by replacing ὀργῆς ("anger", "wrath") by the adjective ὀρθῆς ("straight"), the axis of opposites laughter / wrath (γελᾶν / ὀργή) that articulates the sentence is lost, and the text is structured in such a way that the main syntactic units do not reflect contents of equal hierarchy. As we interpret it, from the main verb δεῖ ("it is necessary") two infinitives depend at the same syntactic level: γελᾶν ("to laugh") and λήγειν ("to stop"); and, in turn, dependent on γελᾶν ("laugh") and introduced by the preposition/temporal adverb ἅμα ("at the same time") we find φιλοσοφεῖν ("philosophize"), οἰκονομεῖν ("manage the house") and χρῆσθαι ("take care of").

Now, the philosophically relevant doctrine is exhausted in the infinitive group γελᾶν ("to laugh"), while the branch of λήγειν ("to cease") remains practically as an addition that has little to do with the previous clause and by itself possesses little philosophical entity.

In the version we offer, the sentence opposes laughter (γελᾶν) to anger and, in general, to violent passions (ὀργή) as philosophical-vital moods."

I don't know if his comments or the translation are correct. I think it can be interesting that you tell us your point of view.