

PD01 - Best Translation Of PDO1 To Feature At EpicureanFriends?

Post by "Don" of July 10, 2023 at 8:14 PM

In an attempt to help everyone in their voting, here are some older notes I had on PD1

Greek text: Usener edition

1 Τὸ μακάριον καὶ ἀφθαρτον οὔτε αὐτὸ πράγματα ἔχει οὔτε ἄλλω παρέχει· ὥστε οὔτε ὀργαῖς οὔτε χάρισι συνέχεται· ἐν ἀσθενεῖ γὰρ πᾶν τὸ τοιοῦτον.

"One who is blessed/completely happy/blissful and imperishable/indestructible has no troubles themselves nor causes troubles for others; as a consequence, they are affected by neither anger nor gratitude; because all this would be an indication of weakness/sickness/lack of strength." Being affected by anger as a sickness or weakness makes sense, but why would being affected by gratitude be a sign of weakness? In the Letter to Herodotus, Epicurus wrote "For troubles and anxieties and feelings of anger and partiality do not accord with bliss, but always **imply weakness and fear and dependence upon one's neighbours.**" This appears to demonstrate that the negative aspects of anger or gratitude would be that it would show a lack of self-reliance / αὐτάρκεια. If we needed reassurance / affirmation from others and didn't just do things because they were pleasurable, we're not truly living a blessed life. That sense of self-assurance would make one τὸ **μακάριον καὶ ἀφθαρτον**. Blessed, yes. Imperishable? This echoes the idea that, once desires are uprooted, they can't come back. Some of the senses of φθαρτος, opposite of ἀφθαρτος, are "pass away, able to be bribed, adrift." Considering the opposite of these qualities gives a deeper sense to what a mortal life potentially filled with ἀφθαρτος would be like. And consider that Epicurus decided that it is **τὸ μακάριον**, neither male nor female. I think that's significant. Some older translation gloss over that when translating the other parts: **he** is exempt from movements of anger. The proper way to express it might better be to use "one who is..."

Perseus Project: [139] [ι.] Τὸ μακάριον καὶ ἀφθαρτον οὔτε αὐτὸ πράγματα ἔχει οὔτε ἄλλω παρέχει, ὥστε οὔτε ὀργαῖς οὔτε χάρισι συνέχεται: ἐν ἀσθενεῖ γὰρ πᾶν τὸ τοιοῦτον. [ἐν ἄλλοις δὲ φησι τοὺς θεοὺς λόγῳ θεωρητοῦς, οὓς μὲν κατ' ἀριθμὸν ὑφ' ἑστώτας, οὓς δὲ καθ' ὁμοειδίαν ἐκ τῆς συνεχοῦς ἐπιρρύσεως τῶν ὁμοίων εἰδώλων ἐπὶ τὸ αὐτὸ ἀποτετελεσμένῳ ἀνθρωποειδῶς.]

Perseus Project translation: 1. A blessed and eternal being has no trouble himself and brings no trouble upon any other being ; hence he is exempt from movements of anger and partiality, for every such movement implies weakness [Elsewhere he says that the gods are discernible by reason alone, some being numerically distinct, while others result uniformly from the continuous influx of similar images directed to the same spot and in human form.]

- **Τὸ μακάριον** - KD1 - blessed, fortunate, wealthy, “well-off”. There appears to me no certain etymology of [makar] or the longer form [makarios/on]. It appears to have something to do with being wealthy (both literally and figuratively?). See also <https://books.google.com/books?id=sPCww...ymology&f=false> , <http://www.crossmarks.com/brian/allsaintb.htm> ; <https://www.studylight.org/language-studi.../index.cgi?a=38>
 - See also KD27 μακαριότης: 27 Ὡν ἡ σοφία παρασκευάζεται εἰς τὴν τοῦ ὅλου βίου μακαριότητα, πολὺ μέγιστόν ἐστιν ἡ τῆς φιλίας κτῆσις. Of all the things that wisdom provides for *the complete happiness of one's entire life*, by far the greatest is friendship.
 - DB - Why translate μακαριότητα (happiness, bliss) *happiness* here but μακάριον *blessed* in KD1 other than obfuscation?
 - ἡ τῆς φιλίας κτῆσις = the property/possession of friendship
- **Ἄφθαρτον** LSJ. incorruptible, Epicur. Ep.1p.29U., al., Phld.D.3Fr.88b, al., Diog.Oen.63, al. eternal, immortal, uncorrupted, undecaying. **Φθαρτον** = destructible, perishable.
- **Πράγματα** LSJ in a bad sense, trouble, annoyance. **π. παρέχειν τινί** to cause one trouble, Hdt.1.155
- **Παρέχει** supply, furnish, provide

Οὔτε ... οὔτε

- Neither... nor

συνέχω

- fut. mid. in pass. sense, Dem.
- I. to hold or keep together, II.: to enclose, encompass, embrace, Hes., Plat.
- 2. to keep together, keep from dispersing, of soldiers, Xen., Dem.: —then, ζ. πόλιν to keep the state together, keep it from falling to pieces, Eur.; καὶ θεοὺς καὶ ἀνθρώπους ἡ κοινωμία ξ. Plat.; ζ. τὴν πολιτείαν Dem.; so, ξ.τὴν εἰρεσίαν to keep the rowers together, make them pull in time, Thuc.
- 3. to constrain or force one to a thing, NTest.
- 4. to compress, oppress, id=NTest.: Pass. to be constrained, oppressed, afflicted, Hdt., attic
- II. intr. to meet, εἰς ἕν Arist.

ἀσθενής m or f (neuter ἀσθενές); third declension **ἀσθενεῖ** DATIVE after ἐν

- without strength, weak
- feeble, sickly
- sick, ill
- insignificant
- poor

τοιούτων

- inflection of **τοιοῦτος**:

neuter nominative singular Referring back to *Τὸ μακάριον καὶ ἄφθαρτον* masculine and neuter
accusative singular Of this kind Such a one