

VS78 - Alternative Translation

Post by "Onenski" of July 4, 2023 at 10:25 AM

You're right, [Don](#), there's not a Hartel manuscript, I didn't read correctly.

Besides, the author, Alberto Enrique Álvarez from the Autonomous University of Madrid gives some reasons for the **νοητὸν** interpretation. One of them it's that at the end of the Letter to Menoecus Epicurus points out that philosophy is an immortal good. I add part of the Enrique's commentary:

"Undoubtedly, the usual structure of parallelisms and oppositions that constitutes many of the sentences, and even the phonetic similarity νοητόν / θνητόν, impel to the correction, which makes it possible to obtain in the text the pairs philosophy-mortal / friendship-immortal. However, these are not sufficient reasons to modify a manuscript whose writing and sense are clear.

[...]

So there is no reason to attribute to philosophy the qualifier of mortal. Hartel's correction is not necessary. It imposes on the text a spirit of symmetry that neither the sense of the sentence nor the thought of Epicurus demand.

[...]

As Bailey says, this is perhaps the greatest exaltation of friendship in Epicurus' work that remains to us; and, in the same sense, Cicero expresses himself, who assures us that Epicurus carried friendship to heaven with his praises (*eam* [i. e.,

amicitiam] *Epicurus in caelum efferat laudibus*). The fact of extolling friendship is understandable, because, as we have seen on several occasions, it guarantees security among men, which is one of the conditions of ataraxia, in such a way that it allows the wise, within human limits, to live as a god.

Now, what is not necessary is that the praise of friendship should entail the corresponding degradation of philosophy, especially when the role of wisdom in the happiness of the wise man is as relevant as that of friendship. That is why we maintain the qualifier "intellectual" that SV78 assigns to wisdom, refusing its modification by "mortal". ("EL GNOMOLOGIUM VATICANUM Y LA FILOSOFÍA DE EPICURO", p. 460-463)