

Modern Neuroscience And The Katastematic / Kinetic Debate

Post by “Don” of July 2, 2023 at 8:37 PM

I'm repeating myself a bit with this post but wanted to keep it for future reference in one spot...

Two key words:

καθίστημι "to make" in [PD21](#) - "to bring into a certain state; bring; replace or restore; etc."

[Henry George Liddell, Robert Scott, A Greek-English Lexicon, καθίστημι](#)

κατάστημα "condition, state, not necessarily permanent: bodily or mental condition"

[Henry George Liddell, Robert Scott, A Greek-English Lexicon, κατάστημα](#)

I want to (once again) compile instances of the use of those words that I feel are pertinent. I am intentionally NOT including Cicero's materials because, honestly, I don't necessarily consider him a reliable source. I'm limiting my sources to Epicurus, Metrodorus, and Diogenes of Oenoanda for now. And, yes, I have to "trust" others for reporting the words of Epicurus and Metrodorus... but at least we have Diogenes' Wall.

[PD21](#) One who perceives the limits of life knows how easy it is to expel the pain produced by a lack of something and ****to make one's entire life complete****; so that there is no need for the things that are achieved through struggle.

ὁ τὰ πέρατα τοῦ βίου κατειδῶς οἶδεν ὡς εὐπόριστόν ἐστι τὸ <τὸ> ἀλγοῦν κατ' ἔνδειαν ἐξαιροῦν καὶ τὸ τὸν ὅλον βίον παντελῆ καθιστάν (< infinitive of καθίστημι). ὥστε οὐδὲν προσδεῖται πραγμάτων ἀγῶνας κεκτημένων.

Fragment 2:

Lack of mental disturbance and lack of bodily pain are static pleasures, whereas revelry and rejoicing are active pleasures involving movement.

ἡ μὲν γὰρ ἀταραξία καὶ <ἡ> ἀπονία ****καταστηματικά**** εἰσιν ἡδοναί. ἡ δὲ χαρὰ καὶ ἡ εὐφροσύνη κατὰ κίνησιν ἐνεργεῖα βλέπονται.

Fragment 68:

To those who are able to reason it out, the highest and surest joy is found in ****the stable health of the body**** and a firm confidence in keeping it.

****τὸ γὰρ εὐσταθὲς σαρκὸς κατάστημα**** καὶ τὸ περὶ ταύτης πιστὸν ἔλπισμα τὴν ἀκροτάτην χαρὰν καὶ βεβαιοτάτην ἔχει τοῖς ἐπιλογίζεσθαι δυναμένοις.

Metrodorus (Diogenes Laertius, 10.136):

Metrodorus in his Timocrates, whose actual words are : "Thus pleasure being conceived both as that species which consists in motion and that which is a state of rest."

Μητρόδωρος ἐν τῷ Τιμοκράτει λέγουσιν οὕτω: νοουμένης δὲ ἡδονῆς τῆς τε κατὰ κίνησιν καὶ τῆς καταστηματικῆς.

Metrodorus, Fragment 5: "Metrodorus, in his book On the Source of Happiness in Ourselves being greater than that which arises from Objects, says: 'What else is the good of the soul but ****the sound state of the flesh (τὸ σαρκὸς εὐσταθὲς κατάστημα),**** and the sure hope of its continuance?'"

Diogenes of Oenoanda:

Let us now [investigate] how life is to be made pleasant for us both in ****states**** and in actions (praxesin).

(εἰσαν τὰ φρόν[ιμα]. ἡμ[εῖς] δὲ ζη]τῶμεν ἤδη πῶς ὁ βίος ἡμῶν ἡδὺς γένηται καὶ ἐν τοῖς ****καταστήμασι**** καὶ ἐν ταῖς πράξεσιν.)

Let us first discuss states (περὶ δὲ τῶν καταστημάτων πρῶτον εἴπωμεν), keeping an eye on the point that, when the emotions which disturb the soul are removed, those which produce pleasure enter into it to take their place.

One thing that I find interesting is that only in Metrodorus (Fragment 5 & DL10.136) and Epicurus' Fragment 68 (i.e., DL10.136) do we find εὐσταθὲς modifying κατάστημα. That's " well based, standing firm, stable (relatively unchanging)." κατάστημα itself is simply "condition, state."

The other references only use κατάστημα and related words alone:

Epicurus: Fragment 2 (& Diogenes 10.136): καταστηματικά

Metrodorus (DL 10.136): καταστηματικῆς

Diogenes of Oenoanda: καταστήμασι

So, the idea of a ***stable/"relatively unchanging"** condition is not necessarily conveyed by the second set of references, only the connotation of "state, condition." If that's the case, then we're talking about "state, condition" in contrast to kinesis "motion, opp. rest (στάσις)". Kinesis in LSJ includes opp. ἡρεμία (eremia) which is also a "quietude of the mind." So, this implies to me that we are, indeed, talking about pleasure "at rest (residing in a particular state or condition)" and pleasure "in motion."

PostScript....:

In thinking some more, I note that Fragment 68 doesn't mention pleasure in general ****BUT**** it does mention a KINETIC PLEASURE!

To those who are able to reason it out, the highest and surest joy is found in the stable health of the body and a firm confidence in keeping it.

τὸ γὰρ εὐσταθὲς σαρκὸς κατάστημα καὶ τὸ περὶ ταύτης πιστὸν ἔλπισμα τὴν ἀκροτάτην **χαρὰν** καὶ βεβαιοτάτην ἔχει τοῖς ἐπιλογίζεσθαι δυναμένοις.

χαρὰν is simply the accusative of χαρά (khara)... Where do we see χαρά? RIGHT THERE in Epicurus's category of kinetic pleasures: ἡ δὲ **χαρὰ** καὶ ἡ εὐφροσύνη κατὰ κίνησιν ἐνεργεῖα βλέπονται.

SO... That means that we could substitute kinetic pleasure in Fragment 68!

- *To those who are able to reason it out, the highest and surest kinetic pleasure is found in the stable health of the body and a firm confidence in keeping it.*

Question, of course, is HOW can the "stable health of the body and a firm confidence in keeping it" be a KINETIC PLEASURE!!??

Curiouser and curiouser!