

Issues In The Meaning And Definition of Logic

Post by "Cassius" of August 26, 2021 at 10:22 AM

As we go through this I would appreciate any comments on DeLacy's formulation that Aristotle had held that

Quote

"inferences from signs are not reliable except in cases where the inferences can be converted into valid syllogisms."

I'm not so concerned that we be able to find a cite in Aristotle to that effect, as I think this is probably just DeLacy's general interpretation.

What I am concerned about is whether this sentence and formulation are useful in describing the issues between the Epicureans and proponents of the "pro-formal-logic" position. And of course in that regard it's necessary to really be able to articulate in a few words the opposite positions so that the discussion is clear.

It appears that Epicurus may have associated the position he is arguing against (and which Delacy may be right in asserting to Aristotle and probably Plato et al) with the "Megarians" ---- but "MEGARIAN" just doesn't cut it as a tag for the position we're arguing against.

We could call them "worshippers of logic" but that is too argumentative and I am sure they would deny that (the worship "god" even as they identify god with pure reason, and similar formulations).

And another example: I continue to agree with Martin's post 46 as to the details of what we are talking about. However in order to use our words clearly, we're going to want to come to some form of agreement (or at least be able to state our own words and definitions) as to what words to use to describe the opposing camps.

In order to decide which side we're on, and understand why, we need to be able to articulate a definition of both camps. I doubt at this point that any of us (including me) are comfortable in setting out what we think the "best labels" for the opposing camps would be. Yes we could call them "Stoic" and "Epicurean" but since we're not clear on the meanings that doesn't help much more than describing one or the other as "Megarian."